

Comparison of Five Flexible Minnesota Pollution Control Agency Air Permit Options with Individual Air Permits

(acronyms are listed at the end of the table)

Feature	Registration Permit Option D	Capped Emission Permit	Individual State Permit with EMS Provisions	FlexCap Individual Permit	PreCap Individual Permit	Individual State Permit	Individual Pt. 70 Permit (Limits to be Minor for NSR)
Type	State (rule-based)	State (rule-based)	State	State or Part 70	State or Part 70	State	Part 70
Thresholds/ Applicability Limits	< 50 tpy PM, PM ₁₀ , VOC, SO ₂ , NO _x , CO < 5 tpy single HAP < 12.5 tpy all HAP < 50,000 tpy CO ₂ e	Opt. 1 < 90 tpy PM, PM ₁₀ , VOC, SO ₂ , NO _x , CO < 9 tpy one HAP < 20 tpy all HAP < 0.5 tpy lead < 90,000 tpy CO ₂ e Including IAs Opt. 2 < 90 tpy for SO ₂ < 85 tpy threshold for VOC, NO _x , and CO < 75 tpy for PM ₁₀ , PM < 8 tpy one HAP < 20 tpy all HAP < 0.5 tpy lead < 85,000 tpy CO ₂ e	Set total facility caps on all pollutants to avoid Pt. 70 following guidance listed under Individual State Permit	Set total facility caps on key (or all) pollutants to avoid Pt. 70 or to avoid NSR major source threshold if Pt. 70	Set total facility caps on key (or all) pollutants to avoid Pt. 70 or to avoid NSR major source threshold if Pt. 70	< 100 tpy of NSR pollutants (and < 100,000 of CO ₂ e): limited at 95 percent or lower < 10/25 tpy of HAP: limited at 9/22.5 tpy or lower Limits lowered to leave room for IAs and compliance method issues (adjusted for individual facility)	< 100/250 tpy (100,000 tpy for CO ₂ e) of criteria depending on NSR threshold: limits lowered to leave room for IAs and compliance method issues (adjusted for individual facility) HAPS limited if source wants to avoid NESHAP

Feature	Registration Permit Option D	Capped Emission Permit	Individual State Permit with EMS Provisions	FlexCap Individual Permit	PreCap Individual Permit	Individual State Permit	Individual Pt. 70 Permit (Limits to be Minor for NSR)
Eligibility	Not eligible if: Acid Rain source Waste combustor SIP requirements Assumed things in an EIS or EAW that must be made enforceable NSPS applies other than those listed	Same as Option D plus: Cannot be eligible for general permit No ethanol plants Must pass ambient air assessment without restrictions No NSPS applies other than those listed	Must have a qualified EMS ISO 14000 only Must pass ambient air assessment	Issuance criteria listed in Minn. R.. 7007.1000, subp. 1	Issuance criteria listed in Minn. R. 7007.1000, subp. 1	Issuance criteria listed in Minn. R. 7007.1000, subp. 1	Issuance criteria listed in Minn. R. 7007.1000, subp. 1
Application Process – Applicant	Very short application packet Need not identify applicable requirements or specific equipment, just eligibility	Shortened application packet, but must provide information on all equipment/ materials Applicant can supplement previous applications	Same as individual permit plus EMS qualification information	Full application packet Must determine all applicable requirements and propose compliance methods for all equipment	Full application packet Must determine all applicable requirements and propose compliance methods for all equipment	Full application packet Must determine all applicable requirements and propose compliance methods for all equipment	Full application packet Must determine all applicable requirements and propose compliance methods for all equipment
Permit Document	One page permit	One page permit	Full permit document Requirements are correlated to equipment	Full permit document Requirements are correlated to equipment	Full permit document Requirements are correlated to equipment	Full permit document Requirements are correlated to equipment	Full permit document Requirements are correlated to equipment

Feature	Registration Permit Option D	Capped Emission Permit	Individual State Permit with EMS Provisions	FlexCap Individual Permit	PreCap Individual Permit	Individual State Permit	Individual Pt. 70 Permit (Limits to be Minor for NSR)
Making Changes	Can make changes without receiving permit amendment as long as remain below thresholds and continue to qualify.	Can make changes without amendment as long as remain below thresholds and meet other eligibility requirements Must do pre-change analysis when increasing emissions to show will meet eligibility requirements (including air standards)	No amendment needed for changes that would otherwise require an amendment due only to an increase in hourly emissions (Essentially means minor/ moderate amendments will not be needed)	Pre-authorizes specific or categories of changes – all annual and hourly potential emissions accounted for upfront. No amendment needed for pre-authorized changes. Amendments needed for other changes.	No changes pre-authorized Emissions cap written to cover any new or modified equipment Amendments still apply to changes under the cap (based on hourly increase analysis) since only the annual emissions addressed upfront	Must apply for appropriate permit amendment (minor, moderate, major, or administrative) for each change at facility that triggers need for amendment	Must apply for appropriate permit amendment (minor, moderate, major, or administrative) for each change at facility that triggers need for amendment
Record-keeping, Monitoring & Reporting	Monthly records and calculations Annual calculations if emissions are < 25 percent of Pt. 70 thresholds Do not have to calculate HAPs if VOCs < 5tpy Follow Control Equipment Rule Compliance requirements in rule	Daily production/ usage records and monthly calculations of actual emissions Must calculate all HAP emissions Follow Control Equipment Rule Compliance requirements in rule but must create tailored compliance plan	Recordkeeping/ calculation frequency on an individual pollutant basis If emissions of any pollutant are < 25 percent of Pt. 70 threshold, then annual calculations Tailored control equipment requirements Compliance requirements in permit	Daily records and monthly calculations Tailored control equipment requirements Recordkeeping for changes made under the FlexCap plus equipment labeling and inventory Compliance requirements in permit	Daily records and monthly calculations Tailored control equipment requirements Recordkeeping for changes made under the PreCap Compliance requirements in permit	Daily records and monthly calculations Tailored control equipment requirements Compliance requirements in permit	Daily records and monthly calculations Tailored control equipment requirements Compliance requirements in permit

Feature	Registration Permit Option D	Capped Emission Permit	Individual State Permit with EMS Provisions	FlexCap Individual Permit	PreCap Individual Permit	Individual State Permit	Individual Pt. 70 Permit (Limits to be Minor for NSR)
Submittals	Shutdown/ breakdown notification	Shutdown/ breakdown notification Report deviations semi-annually only if a deviation Annual compliance certification Submittals associated with applicable requirements, e.g. NSPS	Shutdown/ breakdown notification Report deviations semi-annually only if a deviation Annual compliance certification Submittals associated with applicable requirements, e.g. NSPS	Shutdown/ breakdown notification Deviations reporting every six months Annual compliance certification with report of changes made during previous year Submittals associated with applicable requirements, e.g. NSPS Any case specific submittals (e.g., EI)	Shutdown/ breakdown notification Deviations reporting every six months Annual compliance certification Submittals associated with applicable requirements, e.g. NSPS Any case specific submittals (e.g., EI)	Shutdown/ breakdown notification Deviations reporting every six months Annual compliance certification Submittals associated with applicable requirements, e.g. NSPS Plus any case specific submittals (e.g., equipment inventory)	Shutdown/ breakdown notification Deviations reporting every six months Annual compliance certification Submittals associated with applicable requirements, e.g. NSPS Plus any case specific submittals (e.g., equipment inventory)
Duration	Non-expiring	Non-expiring with certain exceptions	Non-expiring with certain exceptions	Non-expiring with certain exceptions (state) or five-year term (Pt. 70)	Non-expiring with certain exceptions (state) or five-year term (Pt. 70)	Non-expiring with certain exceptions (state)	five year term
Issuance Time	Issue within about 60 days of receiving application	Issue within about 60-90 days of receiving application.	Issue within three to six months from starting work	Issue within three to nine months from starting work	Issue within three to nine months from starting work	Issue within three to six months from starting work	Issue within six to nine months from starting work

Feature	Registration Permit Option D	Capped Emission Permit	Individual State Permit with EMS Provisions	FlexCap Individual Permit	PreCap Individual Permit	Individual State Permit	Individual Pt. 70 Permit (Limits to be Minor for NSR)
Public Participation	No public notice of individual permits issued	List of facilities on agency website that have applied for Capped permit 30 day comment period on eligibility Persons can elect to receive electronic notification of capped applications received	Standard 30-day public notice of draft permit	Standard 30-day public notice of draft permit; simultaneous EPA 45-day review (Pt. 70 only)	Standard 30-day public notice of draft permit; simultaneous EPA 45-day review (Pt. 70 only)	Standard 30-day public notice of draft permit	Standard 30-day public notice of draft permit; simultaneous EPA 45-day review
Emissions Inventory	Annual submittal of total facility emissions (not by unit or process)	Annual submittal of emissions by process	Annual submittal of emissions by process	Annual submittal of emissions by process	Annual submittal of emissions by process	Annual submittal of emissions by process	Annual submittal of emissions by process
Examples of Various Permits*	Minn. R. 7007.1110, 7007.1130	Minn. R. 7007.1140 to 7007.1148	No permit with EMS provisions issued. Can view IBM's prototype	Strongwell – Chatfield Division	Polaris Industries – Roseau Styrotech Inc	River Road Industrial Center Graco Inc – David A Koch Center	Alumacraft Boat Company

List of Acronyms Used in Table

CO - carbon monoxide
CO₂e - carbon dioxide equivalent
EAW – Environmental Assessment Worksheet
EI- Emissions Inventory
EIS – Environmental Impact Statement
EMS- Environmental Management System
HAP - Hazardous Air Pollutant

IA -Insignificant Activities
ISO – International Standards Organization
NESHAP – National Emission Standard for Hazardous Air Pollutants
NO_x - nitrogen oxides
NSR – New Source Review
NSPS – New Source Performance
StandardPb - lead

PM - Particulate Matter
PM₁₀ – PM smaller than 10 microns in diameter
SIP- State Implementation Plan
SO₂ - sulfur dioxide
tpy – tons per year
VOC - volatile organic compounds

* Go to <https://www.revisor.mn.gov/rules/?id=7007> to view the rule-based permits or to <http://www.pca.state.mn.us/air/permits/issued/index.html> view a specific permit.